

# **Barnet Local Plan EIP – Note on the Housing Trajectory**

## **Reason for producing this Note**

On Day 11 (Wednesday 9th November) at the hearing sessions, during consideration of Matter 11 –Delivering the identified requirement over the plan period. Inspector Wildgoose raised a number of issues relating to the Housing Trajectory.

This Note, including any resultant proposed modifications, should cover the following matters

- 1. Review small sites windfall from first three years to clarify if there has been any double-counting within the trajectory.**
- 2. Provide narrative on small sites delivery and difference between historic trend and uplift generated by London Plan small sites target.**
- 3. Provide an update from London DataHub on completions once it is available.**
- 4. Update position if necessary when the next Housing Delivery Test results are published.**
- 5. Provide an update on sites under construction.**
- 6. Clarify Council’s intentions regarding any buffer to supply, with reference to NPPF 74(a) and (b)**
- 7. Recalculate supply with the following sites excluded to provide conservative 5 year supply estimate (notwithstanding and without prejudice to any further justification as to deliverability from the Council or any potential Inspector findings)– Site 1, Site 2, Site 3, Site 4, Site 5, Site 8, Site 18, Site 23, Site 25, Site 26, Site 30, Site 34, Site 39, Site 44, Site 45, Site 48, Site 55, Site 63.**
- 8. In terms of consents on trajectory – clarify the following - Colindale Gardens Stage 2 and Stage 3 (if outline consent only, clear evidence of deliverability needed), gaps in delivery at Grahame Park, build outs at Dollis Valley (hybrid consent), split completions with gap year at 19/6833/FUL (66 Woodside Park Road), confirm completion at 1,3,4 and 5 The Exchange, Brent Cross Gardens, NW4 3RJ. Clarify timeframe for land adjacent to Finchley Memorial Hospital (if outline consent only, clear evidence of deliverability needed).**
- 9. Undertake engagement with developers to establish which sites may be deliverable. Provide clear justification for deliverability where pursued. Resolve any anomalies.**
- 10. Reflect on any potential solutions if the Council finds itself in the position where it does not have the 5YHLS. This could include a stepped trajectory or identification of additional sites.**
- 11. Consider setting baseline as 31st March 2022 with 2022/23 as the base year for the trajectory.**

## **Background**

In producing this Note the Council refers to the following Notes and Examination documents.

<b>EXAM10</b>	<b>LB Barnet Sites Housing Trajectory August 2022</b>
<b>EXAM19</b>	<b>Note on Small Sites</b>
<b>EXAM76</b>	<b>Note on Monitoring Indicators</b>

This Note informs the emerging Note on Housing and Employment Land.

Unlike previous Notes the Council proposes to replace rather than modify the Housing Trajectory in EXAM10. This is because given the number of sites on the Trajectory and the need to clearly show where and when housing is being delivered the normal format of strikethroughs and underlining is impracticable. The Council have updated information on development sites by contacting developers and their agents, cross-checking any progress in terms of planning applications for discharge of conditions or reserved matters/appeals etc. This will provide the latest position regarding the 5 year housing land supply and also confirms the longer term commitment to housing delivery in the Borough.

In order to ensure consistency with previous trajectories the Council has used ward names prior to the changes to wards in May 2022.

## **Considerations**

### **1. Review small sites windfall from first three years to clarify if there has been any double-counting within the trajectory.**

The Council's Housing Trajectory reflects all major development of 10 units or more. It does not include any consents for less than 10 units so there is only the potential for double counting of small sites below 0.25 ha in size that are delivering 10 units or more.

As set out in point 2 below the 342 units per annum is based on historic delivery of small site completions from developments of less than 10 units.

The Council has therefore considered the following options

- the removal of the windfall allowance for small sites for years 1 to 3 of the Trajectory for the calculation of the 5 year supply as set out in Appendix 1; or
- replace the small sites windfall allowance with the number of live consents of 1 to 9 units divided over the 3 years; or
- retain the windfall allowance of 342 units per annum.

The Council considers that the 3<sup>rd</sup> option of retaining the historic allowance of 342 units per annum which is based on a long term trend of completions is the most realistic option. This is because the figure of 342 units per annum is based on developments of less than 10 units. As such, the Council's view is that it is reasonable to rely on this figure in the trajectory as it does not include double-counting. The windfall allowance of 342 units per annum is therefore retained in the calculation of the 5 Year Supply (Appendix 1).

It should also be noted that historically the Council has not utilised a large sites windfall projection in its housing trajectories.

### **2. Provide narrative on small sites delivery and difference between historic trend and uplift generated by London Plan small sites target**

The Local Plan target of a minimum of 5,100 new homes for small sites reflects historic delivery of 342 units per annum from such sites. The Council refers to the 5 Year Supply Paper (Core\_Gen\_29) which states at para 3.1 that minors are represented by an analysis of ten years of past completions for development between 1 and 9 units. The average delivery equates to a figure of 342 units per annum. It is acknowledged that this is below the London Plan 2021 target of 434 units per annum as set out in Table 4.2 but it is a minimum figure based on delivery of developments with less than 10 units.

The Council also refers to the Housing Technical Paper (EXAM1B) which at para 2.34 highlights that the Mayor of London supports the Council's intention to prepare a specific Design Code for Small Sites as part of the Sustainable Design and Development Guidance SPD. Design guidance is also intended to promote the successful development of potential brownfield and infill sites that will support delivery of small sites and potentially inflate the number of units further.

It is the Council's view that the number of units provide a more quantifiable measurement than site area. The Council acknowledges that this could have been better clarified within the Note on Monitoring Indicators (EXAM78) which also erroneously refers to a target of 340 units per annum for small sites rather than 342 units.

The Council refers to its Note on Small Sites (EXAM19) which highlights that the Local Plan reflects a positive and proactive to small sites. Table 1 of EXAM19 sets out how 14 proposals in the Reg19 Local Plan are on sites of 0.25ha or less. Only 2 of these have an indicative capacity of less than 10 units (Site 32 – Manor Park Road Car Park and Site 34 – Burroughs Gardens Car Park). Site 32 has been removed from the Schedule of Proposals due to conflict with Policy ECC04. Site 34 has been removed from the Housing Trajectory to avoid double counting. Through modifications to GSS01 and supporting text as outlined in EXAM19 the Council has sought to clarify its position on provision of small sites. The figure of 5,100 new homes from small sites is more clearly expressed as a minimum. The contribution of small (0.25 ha and under) and medium sized sites (no larger than one hectare) to housing delivery from the Schedule of Site Proposals is set out in proposed modification Table 5B of the EXAM19 Note. The Council intends to update Table 5B as part of the further proposed modifications in order to reflect outcomes of the Inspector Led Consultation with specific regards to the Note on Site Allocations EXAM75.

### **3. Provide an update from London DataHub on completions once it is available.**

The London DataHub has submitted the Housing Flows Reconciliation Form (EXAM88). EXAM88 shows 2,000 new conventional additions to the housing stock of the Borough in 2021/22 and 165 non-conventional.

### **4. Update position if necessary when next Housing Delivery Test results published**

The Council is awaiting publication of the Housing Delivery Test and expects it to reflect the Housing Flows Reconciliation Form (EXAM88). The Housing Delivery Test for Barnet is expected to show **2,091.7 units** ( $2000 + (165/1.8)$ ). This reflects the ratio that the Government applies to non self-contained units in the HDT. Student accommodation 2.5 and all other types 1.8. This is consistent with the London Plan as clarified by the Council's response to point 4 of EXAM90 the Note on Housing and Employment Land.

### **5. Provide an update on sites under construction**

The Council has replaced the London Borough of Barnet Sites Housing Trajectory August 2022 (EXAM10) and added a new column to show the status of all sites. The Housing Trajectory March 2023 (EXAM87) accompanies this Note. It shows that 28 sites on the Housing Trajectory are under construction.

**6. Clarify Council's intentions regarding any buffer to supply, with reference to NPPF 74(a) and (b)**

NPPF para 74 requires that strategic policies should include a trajectory to show housing delivery over the plan period. The supply of specific deliverable sites should include a buffer of:

*a. 5% to ensure choice and competition in the market for land; or*

*b. 10% where the local planning authority wishes to demonstrate a five year supply of deliverable sites through an annual position statement or recently adopted plan, to account for any fluctuations in the market during that year; or*

*c. 20% where there has been significant under delivery of housing over the previous three years, to improve the prospect of achieving the planned supply.*

The Council refers to the most recent Housing Delivery Test Results for 2021. This will be added as an Examination document which shows that Barnet had delivered in the previous 3 years 6,559 new homes against a requirement of 6,087. This equates to a result according to the HDT Measurement of 108%. As evidenced in our response at Point 4 the Council expects the forthcoming HDT results to show yet again good performance on housing delivery in Barnet. A buffer of 5% to ensure choice and competition in the market for land is considered appropriate.

Barnet's requirement is set by the London Plan (2021), which requires a delivery of 2,364 per annum, or 11,820 over 5 years.

Appendix 1 shows that Barnet have carried forward into the London Plan period a shortfall of 622. This shortfall of 622 is added to the target figure. Barnet calculates the Borough's 5-year land supply using the 'Sedgefield' method, adding any shortfall in housing delivery over the next five years of the plan period. To meet the requirements set out in NPPF para 74 a buffer of 5%, then needs to be added resulting in a total 5 year land supply requirement for 13,064 homes.

**7. Recalculate supply with following sites excluded to provide conservative 5 year supply estimate (notwithstanding and without prejudice to any further justification as to deliverability from the Council or any potential Inspector findings)– Site 1, Site 2, Site 3, Site 4, Site 5, Site 8, Site 18, Site 23, Site 25, Site 26, Site 30, Site 34, Site 39, Site 44, Site 45, Site 48, Site 55, Site 63.**

The Council refers to the Site Allocations Note (EXAM75) which considered the deliverability and developability of all these sites and confirms that the outcomes of the Note in terms of numbers and timing of delivery is reflected in the new Housing Trajectory – March 2023 (EXAM87).

- 8. In terms of consents on trajectory – clarify the following - Colindale Gardens Stage 2 and Stage 3 (if outline consent only, clear evidence of deliverability needed), gaps in delivery at Grahame Park, build outs at Dollis Valley (hybrid consent), split completions with gap year at 19/6833/FUL (66 Woodside Park Road), confirm completion at 1,3,4 and 5 The Exchange, Brent Cross Gardens, NW4 3RJ. Clarify timeframe for land adjacent to Finchley Memorial Hospital (if outline consent only, clear evidence of deliverability needed)**

The Council has been in continuous dialogue with developers and landowners since the EIP Hearings concluded.

### **Colindale Gardens**

The Planning Agents for Redrow, the developer of Colindale Gardens, have clarified that for Stage 2, which has detailed consent from 16/7836/S73 for 1,751 units, a total of 1,259 remain to be completed. In terms of Stage 3 (19/6512/OUT is a hybrid planning consent for up to 1,200 units at Colindale Gardens). Reserved matters on 19/6512/OUT continue to be discharged.

Based on information received from the planning agents the Council expects from Stage 2 the following: Block A (347 units) in 2022/23, Block C and D (747 units) in 2024/25 and 2025/26. Block E (165 units) is expected to complete in 2026/27 but start on site is not yet confirmed. From Stage 3 the Council is informed that Block X (212 units) will complete in 2025/26, and Block W (213 units) will complete in 2026/27. Reserved matters on Block X (22/4219/CON) have been approved. Reserved matters for Block W (23/0683/RMA) were submitted in February 2023. Remaining blocks from Stage 3 – Blocks V, Y and Z (775 units) are expected to complete in 2027/28 to 2029/30 although not yet programmed when reserved matters submitted or start on site.

The Council has not included the unprogrammed 775 units from Stage 3 in the first 5 years of the updated Housing Trajectory. It is considered based on the information provided that in total 1,684 units will be provided in Years 1 to 5.

### **Grahame Park**

The Council's Regeneration Team works closely with Notting Hill Genesis on what is in terms of duration the longest regeneration scheme in Barnet. Completion of 19/5493/OUT is not expected before 2037. Gaps in delivery reflect the complexity of regenerating a large housing estate demolishing existing homes and providing new ones, with build-out on 13 separate plots, ensuring that this is in accordance with Mayor's Good Practice Guide to Estate Regeneration. Phasing of Grahame Park Stage B confirmed by Notting Hill Genesis via Regeneration Team. Number is 1948 units (net). Reserved matters (22/2599/RMA) for Plots H and K comprising 364 units approved in February 2023. Demolition of concourse at Grahame Park will involve demolition of 140 units from 4 plots – Plots H,L, G and J over 4 years with 35 units estimated to be demolished each year between 2024/25 and 2027/28. Grahame Park is the only development with units (124 new homes) expected to be delivered in Year 15 of the Housing Trajectory.

### **Dollis Valley**

The Council's Regeneration Team works closely with Countryside Properties and London and Quadrant on a regeneration scheme that started in 2014 and phased development is expected to complete by 2030. Gaps in delivery reflect the complexity of regenerating a large housing estate, demolishing existing homes and providing new ones, ensuring that this is in accordance with the Mayor's Good Practice Guide to Estate Regeneration. Housing Trajectory has been updated to clarify that Phase 3 is expected to complete in 2023 (137 units). In February 2022, the Strategic Planning Committee approved a Reserved Matters Planning application (21/2407/RMA) for Phases 4 and 5 which will deliver 57 new homes

(net). A total of 166 units will be demolished within Phases 4 and 5. Demolitions for Phase 4 are expected to start in 2023 and Phase 5 demolitions are likely to start in 2025. The Trajectory has been updated to combine Phases 4 and 5. The Council considers that this is a conservative estimate based on demolitions starting on Phase 4 in early 2023.

### **66 Woodside Park Road**

This is an error which has been corrected in the updated Trajectory. Planning consent 19/6833/FUL is for 13 new units. Site has been cleared and conditions attached to 19/6833/FUL are presently being discharged.

### **Land adjacent to Finchley Memorial Hospital**

Land at Finchley Memorial Hospital (20/4343/OUT) became a formal consent on 17th December 2021. There was then a delay in progressing because the grant of permission was challenged by judicial review. However, that challenge was dismissed by the Court on 18th November 2022. The failure of that challenge (subject to further appeal) removes uncertainty about delivery of this 130-unit site and the NHS Community Health Partnership is keen to regain momentum on this scheme with applications for reserved matters expected soon. Both the Council and NHS Community Health Partnership consider it a reasonable assumption to have this delivered by year 5 of the Trajectory.

### **Completion at 1,3,4 and 5 The Exchange, Brent Cross Gardens, NW4 3RJ**

The Exchange, Brent Cross, has a number of applications attached with decision date 18th June 2018 (17/1820/PNO for 21 units, 17/1821/PNO for 30 units, 17/0972/PNO for 21 units, and 17/1063/PNO for 17 units). The Council no longer includes these in the first five years of the Housing Trajectory. A further application (20/5375/PNO) for 24 units was made on 10th November 2020 and the approval issued on 29th January 2021. This completed before the first year of the Trajectory and is therefore no longer reflected in the Housing Trajectory.

## **9. Undertake engagement with developers to establish which sites may be deliverable. Provide clear justification for deliverability where pursued. Resolve any anomalies.**

The Council can confirm that the Trajectory is the product of continuous dialogue with developers and landowners since the EIP Hearings. There are no anomalies, the Council has clear justification for deliverability within the first 5 years of the Trajectory and has provided this, where pursued.

## **10. Reflect on any potential solutions if the Council finds itself in the position where it does not have the 5YHLS. This could include a stepped trajectory or identification of additional sites.**

The Council is able to demonstrate a 5 year supply (of 5.4 years) as evidenced by Appendix 1. Table 1 provides the calculation while Table 2 breaks down the source of the supply. The Council considers that this is a conservative estimate based on an update to all sites in EXAM10, published in August 2022. The Council confirms that no new additional sites reflecting new planning consents have been listed as part of the Housing Trajectory.

## **11. Consider setting baseline as 31st March 2022 with 2022/23 as the base year for the trajectory**

The Council has subsequently modified the Housing Trajectory taking 2022/23 as the base year. This replaces the previous trajectory (EXAM10) which had a base year of 2021/22.

## Conclusion

The Council invites the Inspectors to consider the new Housing Trajectory and the justifications behind it as the replacement for EXAM10.

### Appendix 1: 5 Year Housing Land Supply Calculation

Further to additional engagement with developers and confirmation on the status of a number of sites, as outlined within this Note, the Council have provided an update to the 5 Year Housing Land Supply (5YHLS) calculation.

Barnet's target as set out in the London Plan (2021) is to deliver 2,364 net new homes per year. The 5YHLS calculation takes into account the shortfall in delivery since the beginning of the London Plan period (2019) and includes a 5% buffer as required by the NPPF.

Based on current consents and the projected delivery of allocated sites (including small sites), Barnet can demonstrate a deliverable supply of **5.4 years**.

<b>TABLE 1 - 5 YEAR HOUSING LAND SUPPLY CALCULATION March 2023</b>		
A	Housing target for past plan period (2019/20 - 2021/22)	7,092
B	Housing completions for past plan period (2019/20 - 2021/22)	6,470
C	Shortfall (A-B)	622
D	Five year target (2022/23 - 2026/27) (2,364 x 5)	11,820
E	Five year requirement (shortfall + five year target) (C+D)	12,442
F	Five year requirement + 5% buffer	13,064
G	Annual five year requirement + 5% buffer (F/5)	2,613
H	Housing supply (2022/23 – 2027/28)	14,240
I	Housing land supply years + 5% buffer (H/G)	<b>5.4</b>

<b>TABLE 2 - TOTAL IDENTIFIED 5 YEAR SUPPLY</b>						
	<b>2022-23</b>	<b>2023-24</b>	<b>2024-25</b>	<b>2025-26</b>	<b>2026-27</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
Consented	1,423	2,302	2,562	2,165	2,671	11,223
Allocation	0	0	0	513	555	1068
Prior approval	200	19	0	0	0	219
Other <sup>1</sup>	0	0	0	60	60	120
Small sites (under 10 units)	342	342	342	342	342	1,710
	<b>1,965</b>	<b>2,663</b>	<b>2,904</b>	<b>3,080</b>	<b>3,628</b>	<b>14,240</b>

---

<sup>1</sup> Land Adjacent Northway and Fairway Primary School - Permission was granted on 8 April 2016 (15/03138/FUL) and lapsed. The site is vacant and formerly accommodated the old Northway and Fairway Primary School. The site is part of the Council's Asset Disposal Programme and the Council has secured development partners for a Build to Rent scheme at a greater density than the lapsed consent. The Council's Housing and Growth Committee on 14th June 2021 approved proposed sale and leaseback approach to the development of the site; the Kuropatwa Group was approved as the preferred developer. Council is currently in the stages of completing a contract with the developer this month. The Council intends to develop this site where the principle of residential has already been accepted. It therefore includes the extant permission for 120 units in the 5YHLS to be delivered in years 4 and 5.



